

Critical Incidents in Pre-Service Teachers' Beliefs and Motivation to Become English Teachers: A Study of Teacher Professional Identity Construction

1 Jennifer

2 Concilianus Laos Mbato

1 2 Universitas Sanata Dharma, Indonesia

Abstract

Personal journeys in teacher education programs are crucial in helping pre-service teachers to build “a strong and positive professional identity” (Ivanova & Skara-Mincne, 2016; Yuan & Lee, 2015). This study aimed to elaborate on critical incidents regarding beliefs and motivation to become teachers in shaping teacher professional identity. It involved pre-service teachers who major in a Master's Program in English Education at a university in Yogyakarta, Indonesia. As the methodology to collect data, critical incident techniques was used, which constitute five steps: 1) Establishing general aims; 2) Establishing plans and specifications (formulating frames of references and categories); 3) Collecting data; 4) Analyzing data; and 5) Interpreting, analyzing, and reporting data (Hughes, Williamson, & Lloyd, 2007). Some teachers may mix their experiences with blind judgments due to emotional reactions. Thus, critical incident technique enables pre-service teachers to revisit their incidents critically. The results of the study led to a conclusion that lack of personal connections between the participants and people who had taught them contributed to the participants' neutral beliefs about teaching, which in turn contributed to their low intrinsic motivation to be teachers.

Keywords

critical incidents
teachers' beliefs & motivation
identity construction

Ethical Lingua

Vol. 7, No. 1, 2020

ISSN 2355-3448 (Print)

ISSN 2540-9190 (Online)

Corresponding Email

Jennifer

keisdhi.jennifer@gmail.com

Article's History

Submitted 4 April 2020

Revised 11 April 2020

Accepted 11 April 2020

DOI

[10.30605/25409190.172](https://doi.org/10.30605/25409190.172)

Copyright © 2020

The Author(s)

This article is licensed under
CC BY-NC-SA 4.0 License



Critical Incidents in Pre-Service Teachers' Beliefs and Motivation to Become English Teachers: A Study of Teacher Professional Identity Construction

Recently, more and more studies have been conducted on teacher professional identity, teachers' beliefs, and teachers' motivation due to the relation between all those aspects and teacher professional development in general (Richards, Gallo, & Renandya, 2001, p. 41; Botha & Onwu, 2013, p. 3-4; Mulati, Nurkamto, & Drajadi, 2020, p. 2-3). Teacher quality directly affects education quality. For the sake of developing teacher quality, studies on teacher identity have been conducted.

The definition of identity varies from many approaches and viewpoints. However, considering the development of identity studies, there are two popular perspectives, i.e., cognitive and discursive. Kroger & Marcia (2011) state that it was Erikson in 1950 who first studied identity using the notion of ego identity drawn from Freud's psychoanalytic theory in 1946. Erikson's and Kroger & Marcia's perspectives on identity are cognitive. Meanwhile, Britzman (1991) focused on teachers' social and political environments instead of solely teachers' cognition. Britzman's perspective is discursive, which is more into sociology and anthropology. This kind of perspective is also known as poststructuralism (Kalaja, Barcelos, Aro & Ruohotie-Lyhty, 2016, p. 19).

Instead of having cognitive nature, in this study, identity is seen to have a discursive nature. According to Kalaja, Barcelos, Aro & Ruohotie-Lyhty (2016), a viewpoint that identity has cognitive nature is considered traditional. Varghese, Morgan, Johnston, & Johnson (2005, p. 39) in Kalaja, et al. (2016, p. 21) also mention that identity is "discursively constructed" and "enacted through practice." In line with Britzman, Danielewicz (2014, p. 10) defines identity as "Identity is our understanding of who we are and of whom we think other people are." Contrary to the cognitive perspective of identity, from a discursive perspective, we always need to think of other people whenever we think of our own identities.

Kalaja, et al. (2016, p. 21) elaborates the continuity of teacher identity construction, specifically in terms of professional identity, "A professional identity is defined as a continuous dynamic process of interpretation and reinterpretation of experiences, as an answer to the questions, 'who am I at this moment?' and 'who do I want to become?'" There are several kinds of identity. Moreover, this paper focuses on professional identity. Osgood (2006) in Botha & Onwu (2013, p. 3-4) explains that identity formation "is a process that starts during professional studies and is continued during the lifetime of the teacher as a practitioner" Teacher identity formation is a lifetime process, but the starting point is during professional studies. Therefore, this study examines pre-service teachers, who are having their professional study.

Regarding this study, the reason why it is relevant and important to study teachers' beliefs in relation to identities is "A teacher identity also draws on an individual's history and context (Botha & Onwu, 2013), and on their core beliefs, experiences and motivations. These beliefs are heavily influenced by the images and discourses about teaching that is prevalent within

their specific culture.” (Barcelos, 2016, p. 72) Not only beliefs that are important, but also motivations. That is why this study focuses on identities, beliefs, and motivations. However, beliefs receive more attention in this study because of the way beliefs, motivations, and identities are related. Another thing that makes studying beliefs in relation to identities important and relevant is that pre-service teachers are currently having apprenticeship of observation. Barcelos (2016, p. 72) relates apprentice of observation to beliefs, “These beliefs develop further over time as student teachers undergo their apprenticeship of observation as well as when they gain more experience of the practices, values, and skills of the profession.”

We can see how beliefs and motivations shape identities. An analogy of rivers and a sea is given. Beliefs and motivations are rivers, while identity is a sea. However, the relation between beliefs and motivations are not like two rivers that are connected by an estuary. The results of a study by (Barcelos, 2016, p. 86) propose that beliefs affect motivations. From this explanation, we can draw a conclusion that beliefs are like small rivers which go to one bigger river (motivation) and later that bigger river will go to the sea (identity). In other words, beliefs are the source of motivation and identity. That is why beliefs receive more attention.

The authors choose the word river because we do not view the relation between identities, beliefs, and motivations as causes and effects but as interconnected things. Kalaja, Barcelos, Aro & Ruohotie-Lyhty argue:

“beliefs and their interplay with learner and teacher actions and/or with other issues, including strategies, identities, motivation, emotions, or agency are now recognized as being more complex than before, so research designs need to be adjusted to take this into account: instead of looking for simplistic causal relationships, more sophisticated or sensitive research designs should be considered in looking for their interrelationships.” (2016, p. 13)

Yüce, Şahin, Koçer & Kana’s (2013) explanation about three types of motivation in the context of teaching as a career, i.e. “(1) extrinsic motives: job guarantee, money, holidays, social security, appointment, and ease; (2) intrinsic motives: interest, personal satisfaction, and desire and love of profession; and (3) altruistic motives: being in the service of people, society, and country.” In addition to what Barcelos (2016) explains about pre-service teachers’ low motivation, Richardson & Watt (2014) find, “In different sociocultural contexts, such as Brunei, Zimbabwe, Cameroon, the Caribbean, and Jamaica, “extrinsic motives” such as salary, job security, and career status have been found to be more prominent.”

It is important to study teachers’ beliefs because “compared with research on learner beliefs, research on teacher beliefs has made less progress over the past few decades in opening up new theoretical starting points, or challenging traditional definitions or research methodology” (Kalaja, Barcelos, Aro & Ruohotie-Lyhty, 2016, p. 12). Also, considering the current impacts of beliefs, it is important to study pre-service teachers’ beliefs. Pre-service teachers have to understand their own beliefs in order to consider becoming teachers well. Besides having current impacts, beliefs will also impact pre-service teachers’ future. Barcelos (2016, p. 71) argues that teacher beliefs “are now seen as one of the most influential factors behind teachers’ decisions and actions in the classroom” In fact, recently, many studies have been done on teacher beliefs (Barcelos, 2016, p. 71). Danielewicz (2014, p. 9) also argues, “Without much effort, they can see why they must link the methods they adapt to their beliefs. Finally, proposing theories of action forces students to integrate the whole range of variables involved in any teaching situation rather than operating from one perspective alone.”

It is also important to study teachers' motivations because only a few studies have been conducted on teachers' motivations (Barcelos, 2016, p. 71; Dörnyei & Ushioda, 2013, p. 185) and their impacts on the students. (Dörnyei & Ushioda, 2013, p. 185) This study is crucial because when teaching as a profession is considered not prestigious, and the profession does not have a rigorous selection, and pre-service teachers tend to have low motivation to teach (Barcelos, 2016). Barcelos then argues, "in Brazil, as in some African or South Asian countries, teachers are considered 'semi-professionals' and have low status due, among other factors, to the easy entry into the profession." Barcelos's study triggers Brazilian, African, and Asian scholars to study teachers' motivation in the context of the countries. Studying teachers' motivation is important because, in Andersen, Heinesen, & Pedersen's (2014, p. 664) study, students taught by teachers having higher motivation have higher examination scores. However, the result of the study by Andersen, Heinesen, & Pedersen does not necessarily indicate causal relation. It does not necessarily mean that high examination marks are caused by teachers' high motivation because it might be the other way around. However, studying teachers' motivation is still important because "job motivation affects positively and significantly teacher job satisfaction" (Arifin, 2015, p. 38).

Thus, the purpose of the study is to explore pre-service teachers' beliefs that shape their motivations and professional identities. The method of this study is critical incident technique. The research questions are: firstly, what are their beliefs about language teaching? and, how motivated are they to be teachers? Secondly, what are the critical incidents that have shaped their motivations and beliefs? Thirdly, how are their beliefs and motivations related to their teacher professional identity constructions?

The first research question is chosen to elaborate on the participants' beliefs and motivations, which are related to the third research question. The second research question is chosen because although a lot of studies have been conducted on pre-service teachers' beliefs and motivations to become teachers, critical incident technique will help them revisit their incidents and detach themselves from their own personal judgement. The researchers have to critically review the incidents by using their professional judgements. This will prevent the judgement from bias. This also increases the validity of the analysis (Hughes, et al., 2007). The third research question is chosen because it allows the researchers to elaborate the connection between beliefs, motivations, and teacher professional identity of the participants.

Method

Tripp (1993, p. 8) defines a critical incident as "an interpretation of the significance of an event." In other words, a critical incident is an incident that is considered critical by professional researchers (Tripp, 1993). While observing many incidents researchers address, researchers have to examine as many details as possible, especially the cause of the incident. After that, the researchers have to categorize all the sentences uttered by the participants in order to carefully make judgements.

It is a researcher's criticality that makes critical incidents occur, not the incidents themselves. Using a critical incident perspective does not mean focusing on the most unusual incidents. Instead, a critical incident perspective helps researchers look at taken-for-granted experiences more critically. As Tripp (1993, p. 8) already explains, "In principle, we can read any and everything that happens in a critical fashion. Often the events we notice and remember are just routine things we feel good or unhappy about, or things that amuse us" In fact, the most ordinary thing which is considered unimportant can be critical from the

observer's point of view. Any usual everyday incidents can be critical if it contributes to the aim of the study.

Critical incident technique is an approach that has five steps for collecting and analyzing "information about human activities and their significance to the people involved." (Hughes, Williamson, & Lloyd, 2007, p. 3) Those five steps are "1) Establish the general aims 2) Establish plans and specifications 3) Collect the data 4) Analyze the data 5) Interpret and report the data" (Hughes, et al., 2007, p. 3).

The participants are two students of Master's program of English Education, who have not worked as teachers. To focus on incidents happening in pre-service teacher education program, there must be no working experiences since working experiences as teachers might overshadow pre-service teacher education program (Barcelos, 2016). The participants are from different batches. One of them, Dion (pseudonym), studied at the same university as his Master's program for his Bachelor's degree. The other, Galuh (pseudonym), studied at a different university for his Bachelor's degree. The participants are selected considering Barcelos's (2016) finding that a student who never worked as a teacher wanted to take Master's Program of English Education before starting to work as a teacher without a strong motivation to be a teacher. The participants voluntarily joined the research from the beginning to the end of the research. The researchers only report the information which the participants agreed to be reported. The participants were informed that they could discontinue the participation anytime.

From two batches of Master's program of English Education in a university in Yogyakarta, Indonesia, only participants who met the criteria of Barcelos's (2016) finding were chosen. Thus, Dion (pseudonym) and Galuh (pseudonym), who have not worked as teachers, were chosen. For the instruments used in this study, Bukor (2011) in Kalaja, Barcelos, Aro & Ruohotie-Lyhty (2016, p. 21) explains, "this has implications for research methodology: we cannot rely only on self-report instruments, but also need to incorporate classroom observation to find out what teachers do, or use a combination of different methodologies." The first researcher has observed the participants in the class and outside the class. (Only if permitted), the first researcher has access to elaborate the participants' academic performance. A reflective questionnaire is used in this study to elaborate the participants' background, their family members' background (Kalaja et al., 2016, p. 21-22), significant others' information (Kalaja et al., 2016, p. 21-22), the aims of becoming teachers, the processes of entering the university, their English proficiency, their experiences of learning in different contexts, their current activities besides studying, and their activities in their leisure time (Barcelos, 2016; Hughes et al., 2007; Kalaja, Barcelos, Aro & Ruohotie-Lyhty, 2016; Tripp, 1994). Interviews were conducted on this study to elaborate on the details of the incidents since critical incident technique requires details about the context, situation, causes, and related parties of the incidents before including the participants' judgments. The critical incidents to be addressed are: 1) the process of choosing English Education program (Barcelos, 2016), 2) their knowledge on pedagogies, education in Indonesia, and educational policies (Kalaja, Barcelos, Aro & Ruohotie-Lyhty, 2016), 3) unusual teaching-practicum experiences (Kalaja, Barcelos, Aro & Ruohotie-Lyhty, 2016), and 4) emotional episodes relating to teaching and learning (Kalaja, Barcelos, Aro & Ruohotie-Lyhty, 2016). The analysis of the incidents is discussed with the participants again to confirm that all the information and analysis are publishable.

To analyze the data, several steps are done. Frame of reference and category formulation are used for classifying and identifying critical incidents. The frames of reference are beliefs and motivations. The classification and identification are done manually. After that, the researchers interpret the classified and identified data to reach a conclusion.

Results

The categorization process is shown before each research question is answered in the Discussion since the explanation may refer to the categorization. From the reflection and questionnaire, the participants' sentences are categorized into several categories and are labeled with Y = Yes, N = No, O = Optimistic, P = Pessimistic, Neu = Neutral. Regarding motivations, the researchers do not label the level of motivation in the following table. The researchers only report whether there is a sentence that indicates extrinsic, intrinsic, and altruistic motivations in the table. Whether the motivation is high or rather high will be explained afterward.

Table 1. The categorization process of the participants' sentences

Frames of reference	Categories	Sub-categories	Galuh (pseudonym)	Dion (pseudonym)
Beliefs	Thinking of oneself as a teacher	-	N	N
	One's view on teaching and learning	-	Neu (11)	Neu (12)
		-	P (3)	O (1) P (1)
	One's society's view on teaching and learning	-	O (1)	O (1)
	Changes of one's view on teachers and teaching after taking pre-service teacher education program	-	N	Y
Motivations	One's motivation to be a teacher	Extrinsic	Y	Y
		Intrinsic	N	N
		Altruistic	N	Y
	One's motivation to learn in pre-service teacher education program	-	Y	Y

The final step of critical incident technique, interpreting the data and reporting the results, is elaborated in this sub-chapter. Three research questions are answered in this sub-chapter. In line with the number of the research questions, this sub-chapter is divided into three sections. The first section is Participants' Beliefs and Motivations. The second section is Participants' Critical Incidents. The third section is Beliefs, Motivations, and Teacher professional Identity Construction.

Beliefs and Motivations

Participants' beliefs contributed to participants' motivations. The first category in beliefs (thinking of oneself as a teacher) was the starting point both in Galuh's and Dion's cases. Thinking about oneself as a teacher raised an incident in Galuh's case that later on shows connections between beliefs and motivations. Three sentences were used to ask similar questions in different times, i.e. "Did you ever imagine being a teacher?", "Did you ever think of yourself as a teacher?", and "Did you ever consider yourself to be a teacher?" Galuh answered "No" and "Never" to all the questions. Afterward, an incident occurred during the interview.

Excerpt 1

Incident: I have this view currently. Who knows about my future view?

Galuh still had hope for belief shift. This incident occurred due to Galuh's high motivation to be a teacher. When asked on a scale of 1 to 10, how motivated was Galuh to be a teacher, Galuh answered 8. He said in an interview, "Never thinking of myself as a teacher and my motivation to be a teacher are two different things, right?" Galuh's motivation was extrinsic motivation. He said in an interview, "Because I took pre-service education program, I have to see chances to work in educational fields." Galuh saw his possible future from his current backgrounds. His educational background gave him a job guarantee, since his educational background would not be useful for unrelated professions. Another extrinsic motivation was social security. Galuh's society's view on teaching and learning was optimistic. Galuh said in his reflection, "Teachers are still seen as a respectable profession."

Galuh's educational background and society's view on teaching and learning society's view on teaching and learning contributed to his high extrinsic motivation to be a teacher. Galuh's extrinsic motivation and hope for belief shift contributed to his motivation to learn in pre-service teacher education program. Galuh always finished his assignments very well. Meanwhile, the fact that Galuh never thought of himself as a teacher and Galuh's neutral view on teaching and learning contributed to his low intrinsic motivation to be a teacher. Additionally, his pre-service teacher education program did not improve his intrinsic nor altruistic motivation. However, Galuh still had hope that later on, his intrinsic motivation would improve since his pre-service teacher education program was still halfway. The causes of Galuh's beliefs and motivations would be elaborated in the following section.

In Dion's case, the same category (thinking of oneself as a teacher) also raised an incident. When asked in an interview whether Dion ever thought of himself as a teacher, he answered

Excerpt 2

Incident: "Teaching does not suit me since I don't like dressing formally."

Dion considered job suitability from observable behaviors and a social stigma attached to teachers, which was far from casualness. However, when asked about his future direction in the questionnaire, Dion answered,

Excerpt 3

Incident: I still have hope for being a lecturer, but I will consider several things. First, I will consider the salary. Ideally, I should not consider the salary. However, if I get an

appointment to work in a hotel and in an educational institution, I will choose to work in a hotel. I will choose to work as a lecturer if I get an appointment in AB University (pseudonym) because I don't have to adapt to a new environment because I already feel comfortable with the environment. I know many people in AB University.

*AB University was the university where Dion took his bachelor's and master's degree.

Dion had strong extrinsic motivation. In an interview, when asked on a scale of 1 to 10, how motivated was Dion to be a teacher, Dion answered 8. Dion's motivation was extrinsic motivation. Salary, job appointment, familiar co-workers (ease) were parts of extrinsic motivation. Another extrinsic motivation mentioned by Dion was social security. When asked about his society's view on teaching and learning in the reflection, Dion said, "Fine, they're good."

Similar to Galuh, Dion had ambivalent motivation to be a teacher. The fact that he did not think teaching as a profession suited him and he said "I **still** have hope for being a lecturer." showed low intrinsic motivation to be a teacher. The fact that Dion measured his motivation to be a teacher as 8 showed high extrinsic motivation. Regarding altruistic motivation, Dion was asked in the reflection whether his perceptions regarding teaching and learning had changed since he took pre-service teacher education program. He said, "Yea, but somehow the perception changed because of the real life story from my lecturers." He then elaborated in an interview about the most inspiring real-life story from his lecturer, "Mr. Budi (pseudonym) once shared a story about the lack of equity in terms of education in Indonesia. I got knowledge about education in Indonesia. Indonesia still faces difficulties in education. It makes me feel eh (inspired and motivated) when I teach. That's it."

Dion's society's view on teaching and learning society's view on teaching and learning contributed to his high extrinsic motivation to be a teacher. This extrinsic motivation contributed to his motivation to learn in pre-service teacher education program. Generally, Dion's motivation to learn the subjects in the pre-service education program was high even though Dion once faced difficulty finishing final papers. Dion's pre-service teacher education program improved his altruistic motivation, even though his altruistic motivation was not high enough to be reason of hoping to be a teacher. His altruistic motivation inspired him when teaching but was not strong enough to make him choose teaching as a profession. Meanwhile, the fact that Dion never thought of himself as a teacher and Dion's neutral view on teaching and learning contributed to his low intrinsic motivation to be a teacher. The causes of Dion's beliefs and motivations would be elaborated in the following section.

In sum, both participants had ambivalent motivation to be teachers. They had very high extrinsic motivation to be teachers and very low intrinsic motivation to be teachers. Dion had a rather high altruistic motivation but was not strong enough to be a reason to make a decision. Their beliefs contributed to their motivation. Pre-service education program did not contribute to Galuh's beliefs and motivations, but it contributed a bit to Dion's beliefs and motivations. In Dion's case, the contribution was not attached to pre-service education program since a real-life story could be told anywhere.

Critical Incidents

This section elaborates information from the previous section which needs to be elaborated. The things to be elaborated in this section are: 1) The participants' neutral view on teaching

and learning contributes to their low intrinsic motivation to be teachers 2) The fact that Dion was motivated by real-life stories

The participants' neutral view on teaching and learning

Excerpt 4

Incident: I met many kinds of teachers throughout my life and there are so-so teachers, scary teachers, and teachers who able to motivate me to study. From my experience, a good teacher can make his/her class/lecture interesting for the students.

Excerpt 5

Incident: In my opinion, before I took master's program of English education, I thought teaching was about teaching the materials and giving examples of good behaviors to students. However, after taking master's program of English education, becoming a teacher is not only being a teacher but also becoming an educator who later on can learn and apply what we show to them. So, after taking master's program of English education, I think becoming a teacher is not only about explaining materials and giving them examples of good behaviors but also about building our students' good characters.

menurut saya sebelum masuk MPBI menjadi guru ki yo mengajari murid dan memberi contoh hal hal baik yang kelak membuat mereka menjadi lebih baik. Tetapi setelah masuk mpbi menjadi guru menurut saya adalah bukan menjadi guru yang utama tapi menjadi seorang pendidik yang kelak mereka bisa belajar dan mengamalkan apa yang telah kita lakukan kepada mereka. Jadi saya berpikir, setelah memasuki mpbi, bahwa menjadi guru itu bukan hanya menerangkan materi pelajaran dan memberikan contoh sikap baik kepada mereka, tetapi lebih ke bagaimana kita membangun sikap baik murid-murid kita.

Excerpt 4 is from Galuh and excerpt 5 is from Dion. The researchers could not label excerpt 4 and 5 as optimistic or pessimistic, so they were labeled neutral. Excerpt 5 only described what good teachers did. It was an ideal view that had not been adopted to Dion's belief. There was no emotion or reason why building students' characters was important. There was no emotion as well in excerpt 4. There was also no explanation about what it means by interesting in excerpt 4. Even though Galuh said, "From my experience", the excerpt was rather like a common opinion on good teaching. The opinion had not been adopted to Galuh's belief yet.

Excerpt 6 and 7 contributed to the participants' neutral view on teaching.

Excerpt 6

Incident: No I have not. I rarely interact with my teacher.

Excerpt 7

Incident: Interactions with lecturers and the lecturers' influence on pre-service teachers do not really inspire me. However, I always learn from stories of teaching experience told by either novice or experienced teachers.

Kalo masalah interact and influence not really inspire me ya, tapi saya selalu belajar dari cerita mereka dan hal hal yang mereka alami selama mengajar tidak masalah mereka guru baru atau berpengalaman.

Excerpt 6 was from Galuh. Excerpt 7 was from Dion. The researchers investigated excerpt 7 more in an interview and Dion said, “I think I don’t really have personal interactions with my lecturers.” Even though lecturers shared personal experiences in classes, Dion never really had mutual sharing about personal issues. The interactions were merely about academic topics, jokes, and greetings. Dion never felt a strong connection with his lecturers. The lack of personal connections contributed to the participants’ neutral view on teaching, which later on contributed to their low intrinsic motivation to be teachers.

Dion was motivated by real-life stories

Dion said, “Yea, but somehow the perception changed because of the real life story from my lecturers.” To Dion, real-life stories were more meaningful. Thus, real-life stories could change his perception. In sum, the lack of personal connections between the participants and people who had taught them contributed to the participants’ neutral view on teaching, which later on contributed to their low intrinsic motivation to be teachers. Pre-service teacher education programs must make more meaningful connections between theories and experiences. Pre-service teacher education programs must also facilitate more personal connections between lecturers and pre-service teachers.

Beliefs, Motivations, and Teacher Professional Identity Construction

This section explains the participants’ past and current identities which are continuously shaped by beliefs and motivations. Thus, the connections between the participants’ beliefs, motivations, and identities are elaborated as well in this section. In the questionnaire given to the participants, different learning contexts, family background, and teaching experience were elaborated. Those were aspects of identity. The information in the questionnaire described the participants’ past identities.

Dion stated that his favorite learning experience was in his vocational high school because the learning atmosphere was fun and he liked the major. He found a *Bimbingan dan Konseling* teacher who motivated him to enroll in AB University. He said that he was close to the teacher. He confided a lot to the teacher. Their close relationship contributed to his choice. Even though Dion said that he never had mutual sharing about personal things with the lecturers in his pre-service education program, at least Dion once had a teacher who was close to him.

Galuh stated a more pessimistic view on his learning experiences. He argued that from elementary school to bachelor’s degree, the education system was teacher-centered. Students had to obey and followed the teachers no matter what. In master’s program, he argued that pre-service teachers were guided at the beginning and learned the rest of crucial things by themselves. That was why he considered his master’s program confusing. Unlike Dion, Galuh had not found a teacher or a lecturer who was close to him. That was why Galuh had no optimistic view on teaching and learning (see Table 1). The absence of optimistic views on teaching and learning contributed to Galuh’s low intrinsic motivation to be a teacher.

Another thing that contributed to Galuh’s and Dion’s low intrinsic motivation was their teaching experience. Galuh said in an interview that his teaching experience was not satisfactory. He said it was not really teaching. He said he just talked to the students in English. Galuh and his three friends taught about 10 people in a flight attendant school. He said that some of his friends dominated the teaching, so the teaching session was not meaningful to him. Dion also considered his teaching practicum in his master’s program failed. He said that the difficulty

was the preparation since he did not know how to choose the proper materials. Thus, the participants' unsatisfactory teaching experience demotivated them intrinsically.

Meanwhile, the participants got high extrinsic motivation to teach due to what they observed. Galuh's father was a lecturer, and Galuh's mother was a junior high school teacher. Galuh got the idea of social security in teaching as a profession from his parents. Dion got the idea of social security and the salary of educators from his classmates.

Teacher professional identity construction is shaped by past and present experience that contributes to current beliefs and motivations. As discussed in the Introduction, beliefs, and motivations are components of identities. Galuh and Dion had similar identities. They had high extrinsic motivation but low intrinsic motivation to be teachers. The high extrinsic motivation was the result of their observation of their environments, which gave them societies' optimistic views on teaching and learning. What caused their low intrinsic motivations were: 1) the result of their neutral and – in Galuh's case—also several pessimistic views on teaching and learning 2) their unsatisfactory teaching experience.

Discussion

The interconnectedness between identities, beliefs, and motivations are clearly seen in reality. Barcelos (2016, p. 86) show the interconnectedness in one finding of her study, "because the beliefs they hold about teaching show it as a sacrifice, unrewarding and of low status, and because their motivation to become teachers is low, they still engage only minimally in moves to help themselves to become better teachers, and so their teacher identities are still very fragile." In this study, both participants had optimistic beliefs in teaching as a profession, so they had no problem with extrinsic motivation. However, the interconnectedness in this study was seen in their low intrinsic motivation to be teachers due to their belief that they were not suitable to be teachers, which contributed to how they continuously saw themselves as teachers and how they planned their careers. Thinking of oneself as a teacher was the starting point both in Galuh's and Dion's cases, which was in line with Barcelos's (2016) argument. Barcelos (2016) argues that thinking about oneself as a teacher has a profound impact on teacher identity construction. How they saw themselves as teachers might affect their dissatisfaction with their learning and teaching experiences, which afterward verified their beliefs of their non-suitability for teaching as a profession, which afterward led to their career plans. Dion prioritized salary above the professions, while Galuh had not planned his career.

Barcelos (2016, p. 84) also points out another important finding, "where the BA programmes (with some exceptions around the country) do not necessarily demand a very high level of proficiency in the first place. Thus, these student teachers have good reason to fear entering a classroom." In Brazil, pre-service teachers are not selected strictly regarding their English proficiency (Barcelos, 2016). Barcelos (2016) compares the situation in Brazil and the situation in developed countries where pre-service teachers are strictly selected. Those pre-service teachers in developed countries believe that teachers have high social status, since they have gone through a strict process of selection (Barcelos, 2016). In this study, both participants had good English proficiency, but they struggled in public speaking. They constantly developed their public speaking skills in Master's Program due to the high frequency of individual and group presentations in their classes, but still lacked confidence. There was no problem with pre-service teacher selection processes in this study.

The phase of becoming pre-service teacher is crucial (Ivanova & Skara-Mincne, 2016). Yuan & Lee (2015) further explains that “pre-service teacher education programmes should play, not only in preparing student teachers with necessary teaching techniques and skills, but also in helping them build up a strong and positive professional identity to cope with the complex demands and possible challenges in their future work”. Sutherland, Howard, & Markauskaite (2010) argue that teachers’ social processes start in “the students’ preservice education as they make the transition from student to accredited teacher”. Ivanova & Skara-Mincne (2016) also highlight the importance of pre-service teacher education:

“Pre-service teacher education is the crucial time when many students are confronted with the classroom realities for the first time. They enter teacher education with their previous experience as learners at schools. Many studies show that the beliefs gained before university form their understanding of what good teaching and what an effective teacher is. This perception is often challenged throughout initial teacher education.”

Regarding the studies of pre-service teachers, it is good that Danielewicz (2014) draws a connection between adapted theories with beliefs. Theories have to become pre-service teachers’ beliefs in order to have the wisest decisions in the classroom. There is also a connection between beliefs and identities, as Barcelos (2016, p. 72) states, “A teacher identity also draws on an individual’s history and context (Botha & Onwu, 2013), and on their core beliefs, experiences and motivations.” From the explanation, we can clearly see the connection between theories, beliefs, motivations, and identities, which are –as Shulman & Shulman (2004) in Sutherland, Howard, & Markauskaite (2010); Yuan & Lee (2015) explain –critically shaped in teacher education programs.

Ironically, there are still pre-service teachers who have weak teacher identity and have low motivation to become teachers even after enrolling in pre-service education program (Barcelos, 2016). In this study, the participants’ teacher identities were not very weak. They still had several optimistic views on teaching and learning, which could still be developed, so they would have more optimistic views later on. Luckily, unlike pre-service teachers in Brazil (Barcelos, 2016), their extrinsic motivations were strong enough. They needed to strengthen only their intrinsic and altruistic motivations in order to have more certainty of planning their careers.

Both participants lacked personal interactions with their teachers and lecturers. The lack of personal connections contributed to the participants’ neutral view on teaching, which later on contributed to their low intrinsic motivation to be teachers. This was in line with Friesen & Besley’s (2013) and Barcelos’s (2016) argument. Friesen & Besley (2013) and Barcelos (2016) highlight the importance of meaningful interactions between pre-service teachers and people who have taught them in shaping their beliefs on teaching. Friesen & Besley’s (2013) and Barcelos’s (2016) argument also explains Dion’s opinion. To Dion, real-life stories were more meaningful than theories learned in pre-service education program. Thus, real-life stories could change his perception.

This finding gives additional information to Danielewicz’s (2014) argument. Danielewicz (2014) argues that theories have to become pre-service teachers’ beliefs in order to have the wisest decisions in the classroom. Theories are usual things to be learned in pre-service teacher education programs. In order to make theories become beliefs, meaningful personal connections must be made.

Conclusion

Teacher professional identity construction is continually constructed by interpretations of past and present experience that contributes to current beliefs and motivations, which are components of identities. Galuh and Dion have similar identities. They have very high extrinsic motivation to be teachers but very low intrinsic motivation to be teachers. What causes the high extrinsic motivation is their observation of their environments which gives them societies' optimistic beliefs about teaching and learning. Meanwhile, what cause their low intrinsic motivation are: 1) the result of their neutral and – in Galuh's case—also several pessimistic beliefs about teaching and learning 2) their unsatisfactory teaching experience. Dion has a rather high altruistic motivation but is not strong enough to be a reason to make a decision. Pre-service education program does not contribute to Galuh's beliefs and motivations, but it contributes a bit to Dion's beliefs and motivations. In Dion's case, the contribution is not attached to pre-service education program since a real-life story can be told anywhere.

The lack of personal connections between the participants and people who have taught them contributes to the participants' neutral beliefs about teaching, which later on contributes to their low intrinsic motivation to be teachers. Pre-service teacher education programs must make more meaningful connections between theories and experiences. Pre-service teacher education programs must also facilitate more personal connections between lecturers and pre-service teachers.

Acknowledgment

The authors would like to express my gratitude towards the research participants; Paulus Kuswando, Ph.D., whom the authors consult about this research; and Sanata Dharma University, a place where the authors grow.

References

- Andersen, L. B., Heinesen, E., Pedersen, L. H. (2014) How Does Public Service Motivation Among Teachers Affect Student Performance in Schools? *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*. 24(3), 651–671.
<https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mut082>
- Arifin, H. M. (2015). The Influence of Competence, Motivation, and Organisational Culture to High School Teacher Job Satisfaction and Performance. *International Education Studies*. 8(1), 38-45.
- Barcelos, A. M. F. (2016). Student Teachers' Beliefs and Motivation, and the Shaping of Their Professional Identities. In: *Beliefs, Agency and Identity in Foreign Language Learning and Teaching*. London: Palgrave Macmillan
- Botha, M. & Onwu, G. (2013). Beginning teachers' professional identity formation in early science mathematics and technology teaching: What develops? *Journal of International Cooperation in Education*, 15(3), 3–19.
- Britzman, D. P. (1991). Decentering Discourses in Teacher Education: Or, The Unleashing of Unpopular Things. *Journal of Education*. 173(3), 60-80.
- Danielewicz, J. (2014). *Teaching Selves: Identity, Pedagogy, and Teacher Education*. New York: SUNY Press.
- Dörnyei, Z. & Ushioda, E. (2013). *Teaching and Researching: Motivation (2nd ed.)*. New York: Routledge

- Friesen, M. D. & Besley, S. C. (2013). Teacher identity development in the first year of teacher education: A developmental and social psychological perspective. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 36, 23-32.
- Hughes, H., Williamson, K., & Lloyd, A. (2007). Critical incident technique. In: Lipu, Suzanne, (ed) *Exploring Methods in Information Literacy Research Topics in Australasian Library and Information Studies*, Number 28. Centre for Information Studies, Charles Sturt University, Wagga Wagga, N.S.W., pp. 49-66.
- Ivanova, I., & Skara-Mincne, R. (2016). Development of professional identity during teacher's practice. In *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 232 (pp. 529–536). Antalya: GlobELT.
- Kalaja, P., Barcelos, A. M. F., Aro, M., & Ruohotie-Lyhty, M. (2016). Beliefs, Agency and Identity in Foreign Language Learning and Teaching. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Kroger J., Marcia, J. E. (2011). The Identity Statuses: Origins, Meanings, and Interpretations. In: Schwartz S., Luyckx K., Vignoles V. (eds) *Handbook of Identity Theory and Research*. Springer, New York, NY
- Mulati, D. F., Nurkamto, J., Drajadi, N. A. (2020). The Teachers' Beliefs In Teacher Written Corrective Feedback on The Students' Writing. *Journal of Applied Linguistics & Literature*, 5(1).
- Richards, J. C., Gallo, P. B., Renandya, W. A. (2001) Exploring teachers' beliefs and the processes of change. *The PAC Journal*, 1(1), 41-62.
- Richardson, P. W., & Watt, H. M. G. (2014). Why People Choose Teaching as a Career: An Expectancy-Value Approach to Understanding Teacher Motivation. In Richardson, P. (Ed.), Karabenick, S. (Ed.), Watt, H. (Ed.), *Teacher Motivation: Theory and Practice (1st ed.)*. New York: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203119273>
- Sutherland, L., Howard, S., & Markauskaite, L. (2010). Professional identity creation: Examining the development of beginning preservice teachers' understanding of their work as teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 26(3), 455-465.
- Tripp, D. (1993). *Critical incidents in teaching: Developing professional judgement*. London: Routledge.
- Tripp, D. (1994). Teachers' lives, critical incidents, and professional practice. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 7(1), 65-76.
- Yüce, K., Şahin, E. Y., Koçer, Ö., Kana, F. (2013). Motivations for choosing teaching as a career: a perspective of pre-service teachers from a Turkish context. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 14(3), 295–306.
- Yuan, R. & Lee, I. (2015). The cognitive, social and emotional processes of teacher identity construction in a pre-service teacher education programme. *Research Papers in Education*, 30(4), 469-491, <https://doi.org/10.1080/02671522.2014.932830>

Appendix

Reflection

Your Beliefs

1. How did you view teachers before you entered PBI/MPBI? (You can define a teacher and/or describe your perception on teachers you've seen.) (Friesen & Besley, 2013; Barcelos, 2016)
2. How did you view teaching before you entered PBI/MPBI? (You can describe what you know about teaching as a profession and your perception on teaching as a profession.) (Friesen & Besley, 2013; Barcelos, 2016)
3. Have you interacted with inspiring teachers and non-inspiring teachers? How far was the interaction? Did they influence your beliefs about teaching? (Friesen & Besley, 2013; Barcelos, 2016)
4. How do you view teachers now? (Friesen & Besley, 2013; Barcelos, 2016)
5. How do you view teaching now? (Friesen & Besley, 2013; Barcelos, 2016)
6. Have your perceptions regarding teaching and learning changed since you entered PBI/MPBI? (Friesen & Besley, 2013; Barcelos, 2016; Ivanova & Skara-Mincne, 2016)
7. Describe good teaching in your opinion! (Dörnyei & Kubanyiova, 2014)

Note: Motivation in this study is viewed as emerging from the interplay between student teachers' intentions and their interactions in different contexts. In line with the research on students' ideal selves, there might also be an 'ideal language teacher self' (Dörnyei & Kubanyiova, 2014). Dörnyei and Kubanyiova go on to say that 'if we want to understand what motivates teachers to do what they do, we need to gain insights into their images of who they yearn to become' (p. 25)

8. Describe bad teaching in your opinion! (Dörnyei & Kubanyiova, 2014)
9. Describe effective learning in your opinion! (Dörnyei & Kubanyiova, 2014)
10. How should an institution support learning? (Friesen & Besley, 2013; Barcelos, 2016)

Your Society's Beliefs

1. How do you think your society views teachers? (Barcelos, 2016)
2. How do you think your classmates in MPBI and your lecturers view teaching and teachers? (Barcelos, 2016)
3. How do you think your classmates in MPBI and your lecturers view good teaching? (Dörnyei & Kubanyiova, 2014)
4. How do you think your classmates in MPBI and your lecturers view effective learning? (Dörnyei & Kubanyiova, 2014)

5. How does your institution (MPBI) support your learning? (Friesen & Besley, 2013; Barcelos, 2016)

References of Appendix

- Barcelos, A. M. F. (2016). Student Teachers' Beliefs and Motivation, and the Shaping of Their Professional Identities. In: *Beliefs, Agency and Identity in Foreign Language Learning and Teaching*. London: Palgrave Macmillan
- Dörnyei, Z. & Kubanyiova, M. (2014). *Motivating learners, motivating teachers: Building vision in the language classroom*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Friesen, M. D. & Besley, S. C. (2013). Teacher identity development in the first year of teacher education: A developmental and social psychological perspective. *Teaching and Teacher Education*. 36, 23-32.
- Ivanova, I., & Skara-Mincne, R. (2016). Development of professional identity during teacher's practice. In *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences 232* (pp. 529–536). Antalya: GlobELT.